



Report of the National Dialogue on the Implementation of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development in Egypt

"Not to leave anyone behind us"

28-29 March 2017

Grand Hyatt Hotel (Grand Nile Tower)

The Egyptian Association for Community Participation Enhancement in cooperation with the Egyptian Centre for Economic and Social Rights (ECESR) and the Arab NGO Network for Development (ANND) held the national dialogue on the implementation of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development Goals in Egypt as part of the recent United Nations Democracy Fund (UNDEF) funded project. The dialogue was held on the 28th and 29th of March, 2017 at the Grand Hyatt Hotel, Cairo, including experts in the fields of medicine, education, law and social protection, in addition to public officers and partisans, as well as academics and representatives of local civil society organizations, which constituted a suitable environment to lead a rich discussion of multiple points of views and confrontations between different parties. This report presents the main ideas given during the dialogue as well as the key outputs reflecting the expected future results of this national conference.

First day

Opening Plenary Session

The dialogue was launched with the welcome speech of Dr. Magdy Abdel Hamid on behalf of the Egyptian Association for Economic and Community Participation Enhancement in his capacity as the President of this Association and the Arab NGO Network for Development (ANND) in his capacity as a member of its Board of Directors. After introducing both organizations and their respective activities, in particular the project of the Arab Network on the Sustainable Development Goals (2030 Agenda) supported by the United Nations Democracy Fund (UNDEF), as this dialogues constitutes a key part of its national work, Dr. Abdel Hamid highlighted the latest achievements in technical support, capacity building and alternative policy formulation to achieve the rights development vision in the region including the workshop held in Amman two days ago, within the same framework (under the title of "Implementation of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development Goals in Jordan"). Dr. Abdul Hamid started his speech by pointing out that the goals of sustainable development are more advanced and disciplined than the previous ones, as the civil society and many organizations set 169 objectives for 17 goals in order to address many of the challenges, such as the fact that only 8 persons have access to a wealth equal to 50% of human wealth, extreme poverty, famine, lack of access to quality social services, etc. He focused on the definition criteria of poverty line and the determination of the minimum wage. He also brought up a deep question about whether poverty included weakness in the level of freedoms, or whether it is only limited to education, medicine and other human needs.



Prof. Ghosoun Tawfiq gave the welcome speech on behalf of the Egyptian Center for Economic and Social Rights (ECESR) organizing this dialogue then suggested that development comes specifically within the scope of cooperation, which is based on empowerment and the provision of special tools, which requires hard work and effort from the side of academics, government, political parties and civil society organizations. She clarified that all the activities of the Egyptian Centre comply with this scope while building partnerships to achieve a certain unity aspiring thereby to reach the anticipated goals. The Egyptian Centre has written two reports on the subject of development goals in the last few years in partnership with the Arab NGO Network for Development (ANND). Then Prof. Tawfiq briefly explained agenda, focusing on the importance of partnerships with the private sector, health services and the absence of special schools.



First dialogue

Dr. Alaa Ghannam

Responsible of the Right to Health Program and Member of the Egyptian Social Committee for the Right to Health and Comprehensive Social Health Insurance

Dr. Ghannam spoke about the social measures and protection systems currently in place in Egypt specifically on the health insurance level and confirmed that healthcare is a basic, standard and comprehensive right but, unfortunately, the health system is strictly dependant on the political life, economic indicators and social culture. For a fair, effective and comprehensive health system, it should be based on specific concepts such as family healthcare, promotion of early detection of diseases and chronic illnesses requiring high techniques. A successful health system is based on healthy people funding non-healthy ones for the health insurance to be able to cover the cost and payments on behalf of the patients knowing the great importance of such an issue. Furthermore, Dr. Ghannam gave a brief overview on the rates of distribution of different types of diseases and the current global and local trend, stressing that there is no ideal health system in the world and that the greatest capital relies in the well-trained manpower. Dr. Ghannam also gave examples of several systems such as English system considered to be the most important healthcare system in the world as it is entirely funded by the public treasury and the progressive tax and thus it succeeded in achieving a full coverage and social justice. He also discussed the French system funded by the working participants which he considered it to be good, noting that it only provides partial coverage which might be caused by the insufficient participation of the citizens in the financing process as needed.

Then the speaker moved to mentioning the most important challenges facing the health system in Egypt:

- 1- A high share of health expenditure is randomly and directly taken from citizens' pockets in the health service sectors (\pm 70%).
- 2- A high number of citizens does not have any medical coverage especially in informal sectors of employment. It is also impossible to know the contribution of the informal sector to taxes and social protection.
- 3- The financial and geographical obstacles in providing access to the health services especially for the poor residing in rural areas.
- 4- A relative decrease in the quality of health services, especially in the units of the Ministry of Health and public sectors in general.
- 5- The current legislative and legal environment does not help in achieving a real reformation of the health and insurance system.
- 6- Relative decrease in public expenditure on health in general – relatively to the GDP (very closely related to the first challenge).



After giving the audience a historical overview of the development of the health environment in Egypt, the speaker stated that there is a very important organic relationship between health indicators and sustainable development stressing on the fact that the citizen should not incur the cost of healthcare. He also said that the current local health insurance system provides treatment and rehabilitation services to a limited group of workers and employees in the government through insurance funds. Health coverage in this system has so far reached 58% of the population under 6 insurance laws (127/86/23/99/79/32). In fact, it provides a package of comprehensive services (first-second-third). The service is purchased from external parties and the system uses subscriptions, additional payments and government support in its financing mechanisms, but the quality of its services needs constant support and development, especially since it has a significant infrastructure that belongs only to the subscribers.

The interest in drafting projects for the issuance of a new comprehensive health insurance law started in the year 2000. The aim of the new law is providing a comprehensive health coverage geographically including all citizens gradually, restructuring the system by separating the source of funding from the source of the service (approved by the state unions until the assignment of new minister), unifying the existing multiple laws, and achieving social health justice by targeting the most needy groups in the society. However following the January Revolution, the climate changed and the law in its final form was defected but yet mandatory without packages but rather levels of services (basic care, secondary care, third and advanced care). The latest draft was formed of a unified legislative framework including three main corporations, in addition to the Ministry of Health and Population, governing the law in a single framework based on the recommendations of the Counselor and it is as follows:

- 1- The comprehensive social health insurance corporation and its role is to finance and purchase health services at different levels from all health services providers provided to provide a certificate of service quality.
- 2- The healthcare corporation is responsible for technical supervision of service providers and placing it in unified frameworks and a single scope to facilitate the follow-up of their performance.
- 3- Quality and Accreditation Corporation that sets out services quality standards and adopts the quality classification as a main condition for contracting with the comprehensive social health insurance.

It is necessary to work on improving public hospitals before proceeding with the implementation of the law, while being very keen on including a package for chronic diseases and restructuring the Ministry of Health which is currently only interested in organizing and not the finance or the implementation due to the corruption. In this frame, it is necessary to consider that the core of the system is the family and not the individual for it to be demographically and geographically inclusive. Dr. Ghannam concluded his speech by stating that the implementation will be geographically progressive and gradual over a period of 10 years in successive selected governorates and that the Committee believes that this dream law will fix more than 90% of the gaps in the public health



services and current health insurance noting that it is a requirement and an urgent need that everyone should unite together to issue.

Discussion

Dr. Mona Mina

The current law text is in fact one of the farthest versions of comprehensive insurance as the only advantage is the mandatory subscriptions imposed on everyone, but the largest category that will pay taxes is poor and needy people. Unfortunately, this strategy is making us lose all our hospitals because it does not seek reformation but rather rebuilding a new system. She gave a number of examples including cases where the father of a sick child had to choose between providing healthcare or sending his child to school, while focusing on the obvious annulations in the last version of the law:

- 1- The percentage of contributions was increased (meaning the amounts covering the treatment costs) to cover 20% of the value of medications, 10% of the value of radiation, 5% of the value of medical analysis with cancelling the maximum value of contribution by annulling the previous text; it also stipulated an annual increase of 7% (7% for the annual allowance of the salary only and not the total salary).
- 2- The wife's subscription paid by the family provider was raised from 2% of the total salary to 2.5% of the total salary and the child's subscription was raised from 0.5% to 0.75%.
- 3- The draft law states that the method of services provision through "contracting with hospitals of the governmental sector or private sector should take place after obtaining a certificate of quality and accreditation while commenting on possible quality standards, noting that there is 50% deficiency in the nursing staff in hospitals where the salary is below the minimum wage, and hospitals also lack basic tools such as cotton, gauze, etc. in addition to trained nursing staff and doctors.
- 4- Employees receiving a salary are obliged to pay the subscriptions of the supported wife and children instead of the state as provided for in the previous version.
- 5- A percentage of 20% of the contributions shall be paid by those in need, people receiving salaries, chronically ill persons, residents of social affairs institutions and homeless children (art. 37); any imposition of contribution percentages on this category is a clear cause for their inability to receive treatment when needed.
- 6- The chapter on the funding provided for in the previous version stated that "government expenditure is not less than 3% of GDP" and added many types of taxes collected in favor of health insurance. The current funding chapter crossed out the phrase "government expenditure is not less than 3% of GDP", as well as decreased the taxes collected for health insurance.
- 7- How can the partnerships between the public and private sectors access the health sector within the framework of social protection?



- 8- She explained that we cannot rely on the fact that investors do not want to buy hospitals. It is required is to clearly state that government health facilities shall remain the property of the state and are not offered for partnership with the private sector. The healthcare corporation is committed to avoid and to address any reasons for the low quality of health services.
- Professor **Mohamed Shereen** stressed on the sixth point.
 - Professor **Fatima Ramadan**: The system pays for itself, but it is not expected to have self-sufficiency.

When we talk about the percentage of those below the poverty line before inflation and floatation, it exceeded 40%. Does this mean that the government is willing to pay for more than 50% of the Egyptian people to cover the health insurance fees? This also raises the question of whether the government will be committed to this coverage or will it result in the privatization of hospitals and the sale of assets without providing services at the end.

- **Dr. Soumaya Ibrahim**: We should consider the whole life cycle, not just motherhood and childhood. The Ministry of Health's perception of women in any other frame is unclear. We should also learn from the German experience in alternative medicine and take into account the current medications trade issue.
- **The answer:**

Dr. Ghannam agreed on all the received comments, pointing out that the Committee is non-governmental but rather social and this is why he left the ministry and joined the committee. Then, he mentioned the following:

- 1- There are no diseases packages but rather levels.
- 2- The law lacks seriousness and there is an actual deficiency in doctors and hospitals, but this law is still a draft.
- 3- The idea of buying the service from the private sector exists for objective reasons including the large number of private hospitals and therefore this law will regulate the health private sector.
- 4- The law of female breadwinners and the definition thereof has not been put in place for known political reasons as well as the definition of female breadwinner.
- 5- The committee has struggled and is not responsible for the actions of the Government.



Second dialogue

Professor Omar Ghannam

Economic Researcher at the Egyptian Centre for Economic and Social Rights (ECESR)

Prof. Omar spoke about the Egyptian Center report on the 2030 strategy focusing on the economic aspect and specifically the activities of the Center within the framework of the sustainable development objectives. He mentioned the details of each of the first, eighth and tenth objectives as follows:

1. First Objective: Ending poverty:

- Ending extreme poverty (less than \$1.25 a day)
- Reducing all kinds of poverty by half of its current spread.
- Adopting protectionist policies for the poor and the marginalized.

2. Eighth Objective: Valuable work and economic development:

- Developing and diversifying economic activities with emphasis on labor-intensive sectors.
- Achieving full employment and gender equality.

Tenth Objective: Disparities Reduction:

- Achieving income growth of minimum 40% at an increasing rate compared the national average.
- Adopting monetary policies for wages and social protection to achieve social and economic equality.

In addition to the selected government objectives such as:

- Public debt ratio of GDP 50%.
- Inflation rate between 3-5%.
- Real growth rate of 7%.
- Increase of women participation in the labor force.
- Increase of the contribution of services in GDP to 70%.
- Egypt is one of the world's 30 largest economies.
- Egypt within the Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) win 10 years.



- Reducing the unemployment rate to 5%.
- Real GDP share per person is 7.8 thousand dollars per year.
- Reducing poverty rates to 15%.
- Increasing the dependency on local resources in the energy sector.

The current economic indicators are as follows:

- Current domestic public debt rate is 85% and external debt is over 6.5% increasing continuously.
- Inflation rate in January 2017 is 29.6% compared to 24.3% for December 2016; monthly inflation rate in January 2017 is 4.3%.
- Average poverty line is 482 Egyptian pounds (less than USD 1 per day according to the current exchange rate).
- Current poverty rate is currently 27.8%, where poverty rates have steadily increased in the past 15 years.
- Expected current growth rate is nearly 4.3% and it should be noted that the Government did not reach the expected rates in the past years. It was expected to reach 5.4% in the fiscal year 2019.
- For the achievement of this goal, we have to achieve growth rates exceeding 9% from 2020 to 2030 which is unlikely to happen.
- The participation of women in the labor force has increased by more than 50% in the last 15 years, reaching 23.4% of the total labor force.
- The current rate of unemployment is 12.7% and is increasing. Unemployment rates for women are more than double of the national average and their representation in the informal sector is disproportionate and growing in urban areas.
- The Government did not present any strategy to prepare the working environment for women.

Whereas all the poor in Egypt are below the extreme poverty line, the government must commit to end poverty in its current form, also by reducing the current economic crisis represented by the weakness of the Egyptian pound, inflation in food prices, austerity, and reduction of government expenditure and absence of effective protection policies. The government shall also increase the annual average individual income which currently stands at USD 3436 per year (before the liberalization of the exchange rate) as per its circular in this regard while the objectives are aiming at achieving another level varying between 4036, 7800, and 10000.

Questions and comments

- Growth rate is not important as a high growth rate does not reflect the average income or life conditions and the achievement of 10% is not the goal.
- Why does Egypt think about nuclear energy while it has solar energy, as well as it is a very rich country in resources and gold? The problem is in robbery, corruption and



mismanagement. The biggest proof of its wealth is that it is looted but still standing and steadfast.

- Gender is very important; discrimination and economic inequality (social gap) are the result of the difference in wages.
- We want a real strategy. When we look at the erasure of energy, we find that our goal is very difficult to reach in the near future.

The priorities are unclear and unrealistic. One of the essential ignored things is water security.

- There is a desire for reformation, but there is a problem in the implementation thereof, especially since formal mechanisms do not exist.
- An alternative strategy is a must.



Third dialogue

Professor Mohamed Jad

Egyptian Journalist and Researcher

Professor Jad discussed the method of adopting economic and development policies as a way to achieve the goals of the 2030 agenda, namely in what concerns the civil service and the improvement of wages. He stated that the distribution of wages should be on a fair basis, which is the basis of the Civil Service Law (51) and the Law (64). During Abdel Nasser's period, the expenditure rate was not high (it was based on political grounds), but did not have any financial impact whatsoever. President Sadat tried to issue a reform law. As for the Law (78), it gives a great importance to basic wages, but variable wages are an incentive and a kind of reward, but this has led to considerable wage disparities, especially since it allowed for acts of corruption and exploitation (favoritism). The speaker confirmed that the first budget under the new civil service law is based on Abdel Nasser system. Hosni Mubarak also adopted a decentralized incentive system. Taxes have led to many incentives and political influence is really what affects this resolution. This means that a modest increase in wages (only 11%) is not an important change.

The speaker explicitly stated that the budget will lead to more poverty and will weaken the middle class. He said that the formation of the parliament now will result in an addition on the civil service and added that this issue must be dealt with on a day by day basis as it is difficult to talk about it on the long term. Professor Mohammed also believes that the report of the Fund Agreement and other upcoming measures will aggravate the situation along with the state's discharge system in several sectors. Consequently, the Civil Service Law will lead to an increase in poverty, while Boutros Ghali's law became almost void following the end of his assignment at the Government. In the end, he added that the method of placing the current insurances and pensions is very complex and is based on a comparison with the previous method when the old law was clear and explicit and based on two articles only, and therefore the goal should be to preserve the old laws.

Discussion

- It is known that international laws push for partnership with the private sector and this leads to an inflation in prices, but also has advantages as it did not lead in the past to many of the problems that I mentioned previously.
- Partnership with the private sector is only a financing tool and has justifications such as cement factories which aimed to reduce prices but initiating this method leads to the commoditization of basic services such as education, healthcare and especially the latter as it is linked with the right to life .
- The problem of democracy is really important but we cannot ignore everything and focus on it.



Second day

First Dialogue

The facilitator of the session: Prof. Salma Hussein - Economic Researcher at the Egyptian Initiative for Personal Rights

Commentators: Beesan Kassab - Economic journalist

Majed Murad - Representative of the Egyptian Democratic Party

This session focused on poverty indicators used in the goals of sustainable development and how to structure and measure these indicators. It also addressed the “Takaful and Karama Program” by stressing that the purpose thereof is not only for social protection but also to support the poor in general. The most important thing mentioned is that the International Monetary Fund (IMF) has stipulated an additional expenditure on education and health in Egypt while this expenditure is still only equal to 12% of our needs. Each country must work to eradicate poverty and then hunger and to improve education as this is the starting point for the process of redistribution of wealth as mentioned in the goals of sustainable development. It also should be taken into account that all decisions made so far have led to a decline in the quality and level of education and health services. The most recent poverty assessment in Egypt was done through the World Bank in late 2006. As for this year, Egypt was not included in the last database (the proportion of people living on less than USD 1.9 a day). The Minister of International Cooperation in Egypt is requesting the bank to conduct a poverty assessment in Egypt.

The poverty measurement program in Egypt is based on the basic needs (food, water, housing ...) that define the poverty line. Poverty in Egypt is characterized by being geographically and categorically based in a well-known and clear manner. Professor Salma stressed on the importance of purchase power (equivalent to USD 1.9 in Egypt) during this calculation in light of the change in the exchange rate. It was also pointed that it is necessary to intervene in increasing the support of food and reducing the support of energy because the beneficiaries of energy are the rich and influential people, in addition to the need to modify the method of support and to take into account the issue of unfair and sometimes incorrect distribution of as it may include the poor and rich and thus become unethical.

Professor Besan Kassab

She pointed out in the beginning to the link between poverty and the size of income in general and stated that targeting poverty has turned in the official discourse to one of the social protection policies and not one of the political economy aspects. She indicated that the government is in fact adopting a false discourse that has nothing to do with reality as targeting poverty means more than



just having social protection programs, no matter how good and effective they are. Kassab continued by explaining that targeting poverty means mainly to pay attention to the health, education and support issues. Thus, the rights of poor cannot be limited to the right of receiving in-kind indirect support or direct financial support to satisfy their basic needs, in fact social policies are linked to education, health and public expenditure and go beyond the idea of supporting energy and food items. She also noted that that the increase in expenditure in education and health files is lower than last year, for instance in 2016/2017 the expenditure on the health sector reached 8.9% compared to last year 20.9%. In the same year, the International Monetary Fund (IMF) declared that expenditure on education and health should be increased as a “mitigation procedure for the poor”. Instead, a value-added tax (VAT) was imposed, a tax that in which a severe reduction of the progressivity principle and aggravated the suffering of the Egyptian economy which is actually threatened to collapse at any moment, not only because of its inflationary effects, but also because it is an unfair tax by nature due to its association with prices rather than income. It thus eliminates the idea of progressive tax provided for by the law, which was supposed to lead to a fair distribution of the tax burdens, but this is no longer possible, which in practice means that the rich will benefit from the middle class and poor.

- She also indicated that “Takaful and Karama Program” was passed because it is targeting the poor instead of supporting energy and was presented as a “social protection” tool even though it is designed as a reform of the social security pension.

Professor Majed Murad:

- The eradication of poverty is the first of the objectives of sustainable development and what we see of strategic decisions of the state during the previous years caused an increase in poverty in general while claiming that the state is seeking development as the percentage the poor witnessed an increase from 27% and included the middle class due to the weakness of purchase power and the reduction of support to the energy which in turn led to an increase in the electricity prices while no adjustments were made in terms of the salaries. Thus, the social class gap became wider. The citizen was not compensated with health and educational programs and I do not see this reflected in any of the decisions, which refers to a decline in the level of education and health.

Professor Salma Hussein:

- Limited programs in treating the poverty issue.
- With regard to targeting poverty, she indicated that poverty has been concentrated geographically at 60% in the villages of Upper Egypt. Poverty is concentrated in a certain social class, namely wage earners (poor workers), as the size of this segment has steadily increased over the past years. If one key policy has to be issued to reduce poverty, it must start from the villages of Upper Egypt. Proper programs or policies should be designed in the simplest methods of targeting (infrastructure, nutrition, health units) in order to provide the services directly to those in need.



Discussion

Professor Hania Shalkami

- Numbers do not mean anything because they are a limited digital reference, but our use of numbers must be purely political and arithmetic in order to maximize the political role.
- There is a World Bank study that evaluates the measurement of inequality based on the quality and accuracy of numbers.
- Gender policy should not be limited to protection but also to improve public expenditure and wage levels in addition to a generalized support (education and health), especially for specific groups.
- 70% of our schools and government hospitals should be improved to the extent that the middle classes, not just the rich classes can access these services. The support begins with improving transportation means and all sectors related to the actual access of the citizen to service. This selection method ensures the benefit of the neediest.
- Support should be provided to those in need requiring formal and sensitive measures that must be accompanied by job opportunities and economic revitalization.

Professor Omayma Kamal

- She agreed with the idea of targeting and raised a debate on the definition of the vulnerable ones. She pointed out that according to the current law the vulnerable ones are determined by the Central Agency for Mobilization and Statistics in cooperation with the Ministry of Planning, which is very dangerous, as according to the latest income and expenditure report, the agency recommended that a segment of those who are getting support (food assistance card) are not eligible, since they are spending more than 1000 Egyptian pounds per month which means that if the agency was identifying categories eligible for support, specific segments will be deleted which will result in a real crisis and will be unfair to many of the beneficiaries.

Majed Murad

- He mentioned that there is a need for a strong statistical database that reflects the community reality and divides the segments, income and expenditure to be consistent with the strategic decisions to ensure support for the beneficiaries.

Salma Hussein

- She pointed to the existence of a recent development in the collection of data for the study of poverty indicators, but there are technical difficulties in collecting information, as well as difficulty in reaching some social segments (rich and poor). Thus, both segments of the income ladder are not clearly represented in the income and expenditure indicators of the



Central Agency for Public Mobilization and Statistics. She added that almost tenth of the families' income is allocated to education, as when expenditure on education is improved, one of ten pounds earned by the family provider will be paid to other things. There is a debate about whether support programs are targeting specific categories or whether it is a generalized support which has developmental benefit in certain areas such as education and health, which results in general development results.

Beesan Kassab

She commented by saying: "I do not have sufficient experience to determine the efficiency of the Agency for Mobilization and Statistics, but I believe that the agency should not take the lead as a neutral party and its speech should be generalized". She believes that the issue has a clear political dimension as for instance the social society is being limited to only civil organizations rather than having a broader perception of it including parties and unions, which are more closely related to poverty issues. It is clear from the promulgation of laws such as the new law on associations, the absence of pluralism and trade unions, which means that the drafters of the strategy do not consider these parties are mainly concerned with reducing poverty.

Dr. Mona Mina

She agreed with what mentioned previously and stated that general or simple targeting gives natural results and reach the most needy but identifying the neediest ones according to numbers puts us in the dilemma of data collection, analysis, printing which are also time consuming. In the end, the figures do not reflect the nature of the situation, for example improving public hospitals targets the poor directly.



Second dialogue (round circle and discussion)

Facilitator of the Session: **Dr. Magdy Abdel Hamid**

Main Commentators:

Dr. Mohamed Bassiouni - representative of the parties, specifically the Nasserite Party (Al Karama Party)

Ayman El-Sabeh, Researcher in the Right to Health Program of the Egyptian Initiative for Personal Rights

Dr. Mona Mina - Undersecretary of the Egyptian Doctors Syndicate

What are the main features of the current health insurance system and the new project? What is the community assessment portal for government hospitals? Knowing that the biggest issue is the health insurance...

The session was launched with a speech delivered by Dr. Majde Abdel Hamid, where he mentioned that the draft law (of health insurance) which will be presented to the parliament soon, is raising a dispute just as the general vision in dealing with the issues of social protection and follow-up systems in Egypt in general is also raising a dispute.

Dr. Ayman Al-Sabeh

Dr. Ayman pointed out that the draft law aims at providing health coverage to all citizens without discrimination and will affect the private health sector directly. He added that the most important aspect of the draft law is to separate the different providers of the service and the funders thereof and all that is related to the governance of the health system, which will reflect negatively on the achievement of community participation and transparency if a change was made thereto. He added that law drafters are exposed to a violent wave of opposition on the draft law and there is a tendency to impede its adoption as it will place greater obligations on the state. He also stressed that the community dispute on the draft law requires a broad debate as the unified goal is the existence of a comprehensive social insurance framework covering all citizens.

- 1- The dispute over this law is not enough because such a law with its effects and its consequences is a very serious issue that can change the health and social system in general.
- 2- My opinion is different concerning the private sector which provides health services, especially in terms of separation of the different authorities and the evaluators thereof.
- 3- Any change in this health system will not allow a comprehensive participation.
- 4- The dispute over the law is not limited to being with or against, but there is an agreement on the need to establish an insurance framework.



- 5- There is something important linked to the baselines and the first idea is "the right to access this service" because this leads the discussion to another side far from the potential of the state.

Comments of Dr. Magdy Abdel Hamid

He stressed that when addressing the issue of healthcare in Egypt, there are several starting points; the first one is the comprehensive healthcare for citizens which is a right that must be provided by the state to the citizens, he brings up a discussion in this regard on whether or not the state is capable; there is another tendency to reject all policies and thus the state can play different roles in providing resources and capacities to meet the demands and basic rights of citizens.

Dr. Mona Mina

- She clarified in the beginning that the broader framework to discuss the draft law relies on the status of social protection for health and its implementation may be observed through practical examples. The Egyptian constitution criminalizes the refrain from providing medical services under a state of emergency for any reason. In spite of that yesterday, the cost of protection in Imbaba Hospital (emergency) was raised from 2 pounds to 20 pounds. This is the current status of the health issue, in addition thereto the provisions of Article (18) of the Constitution are not applied to the health aspect and the managers of hospitals are authorized to take all required procedures in order to finance the hospitals taking into account the budget deficit.
- Dr. Mina disagreed with Dr. Basiouni on the general agreement idea with the law because the reforms required by the law are radical as this suggestion does not reflect in anyway the seriousness of dealing with this issue, for instance there is a need for more than 10,000 family doctors and Dr. Ghannam's suggestion proposes that there is 1800 family doctors in Egypt which is not true because those 1800 Doctors are registered in the syndicate records but most of them are not in the country and preferred to work in the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia as their education scholarship was from Saudi Arabia to the Ministry of Health and after the end of the training most of them traveled abroad. Thus, such a suggestion does not reflect the needed seriousness as there are no lists of basic materials or distribution of doctors. She added that the draft law states in Article (12) that "the state is committed to upgrade the efficiency of its health facilities gradually, before starting to apply the system in the governorate which is scheduled to start following the accreditation thereof". When discussing with the law drafters, they explained that health facilities will be upgraded to reach the minimum level before contracting in order to get into the system, and it will be examined after one year and if no improvements were made, they will be removed from the system. She added that we are requesting to have a clear text stating that hospitals will remain the property of the state and managed by the latter and as such these hospitals may



not be subjected to partnership or management by the private sector. In addition, we must avoid any reasons for the lack of quality of health services in health facilities. She continued that we are not against the existence of the private sector in the health services through contracting, but it is not acceptable to take over public hospitals due to the inability of the public sector to compete.

- Among the critics against the law is “imposing contributions” as a financing mean and not to prevent misuse along with imposing pensions for the vulnerable ones, homeless children and chronic diseases patients. In all countries of the world, a small cost is imposed on receiving the service as a kind of attrition of doctors and service but the absence of exceptions and maximum limit placed thereon is considered illogical. In addition, the law does not consider the social dimension of the vulnerable ones, as it stipulates that families not paying health insurance premiums for their children will not receive the service and will not be able to complete their education in schools as it is a basic procedure for school enrollment.
 - We have a deficiency in doctors, nurses, beds, basic resources and medical supplies, how does the quality corporation operates in this field?
 - She stressed that we must start with the preparation of health units and work to provide the basic requirements and then such a law can be promulgated but it will not improve the service. However, procedures must be taken to improve the current service before the promulgation thereof.
- 1- The Constitution does not allow refraining from providing any emergency healthcare service, and therefore the subject of late admission is very dangerous and a severe violation.
 - 2- The Ministry of Health trained family doctors through the scholarship granted by Saudi Arabia, while these funds could have been used more efficiently.
 - 3- The list of essential medications has not been yet prepared.
 - 4- The purchase of the service should be activated by non-profit organizations, and cover the deficiency in doctors, beds and basic supplies while offering reasonable prices.

Dr. Mohamed Basiouni

Dr. Basiouni pointed out that the basic problem lies in the philosophy of law which considers the health service as a commodity, which is a contrary perception to the Egyptian Constitution which ensures the right of the citizen to receive health service as it is unacceptable for a citizen to be deprived from the service because he is financially unable to cover the cost thereof. He added that some health insurance hospitals are located in the middle of cities in places of high prices and according to the law if it was privatized because the quality level is not suitable to provide the service, the suffering of the majority of people who are financially vulnerable will definitely increase. Basiouni requested in the end to raise the quality of governmental hospitals and to keep the health insurance corporation a non-profit organization. He also pointed out to the perception of the doctors’ syndicate in partnership with the right to health committee and many political parties and civil society organizations about the health insurance law due to the disagreement in terms of the philosophy of that law.



Discussion

Mr. Hassan Barbari, accountant interested in economic affairs

Mr. Hassan pointed out that he believes there is a crisis regarding the budget of the projects although the constitution stated that a share of the GDP is allocated to the health insurance and added that Egypt passed through the experience of privatization in the 70's and its results were catastrophic. He also clarified that the lack of accurate state statistics detecting the dysfunction raises a lot of questions such as: why the all government hospitals suffer from poor service and low quality? Why a part of the expenditure on the health insurance corporation given from the state budget was returned and considered to be a financial surplus despite the complaints of lack of materials and deterioration in hospitals? If privatization of hospitals is the solution, is the private sector able to provide quality service?

- 1- The main problem is in the governance and quality in the health sector as well as in all other sectors. Hence, a strategy and priorities must be developed not to make the comprehensive insurance law a missed opportunity like the law of social protection.

Professor Fatima Ramadan:

Prof. Fatima has a different point of view concerning the discussion of law and commented that the problem lies in the discussion of all subjects, since the law is the solution and it is not implemented in the end. She considered that the solution is in determining a strategy or determining priorities to solve health problems and a part of it will be the health insurance law to avoid repeating the experience of the civil service law which required adjustment but the insistence of its drafters to be issued in this form turned it into a way to get rid of employees working in the state, a strategy that highlights some topics such as the culture of nursing in Upper Egypt and improvement the community perception of the nursing service as well as the development of a plan to keep the doctors by ameliorating the wages and training and as a more inclusive perception, of "how can we cover the state deficiency".

Professor Beesan Kassab

She agreed with the vision of Dr. Mina and added that there is an agreement on the goals in general and there are indicators of improvement that are not reflected in the form of expenses that the state is bound to cover. As such, the health insurance law does not comply with the constitution. The draft law states the general purposes to provide the service with quality not yet elaborated in the determination of expenditure and specific rates.

- 1- There should be implementation mechanisms and clear indicators of implementation as well as an alternative plan in the case of none or unsuccessful implementation.



- 2- The government wants to buy the service from the private sector and at the same time make the service cheaper, this means that it will be not able to afford this cost and thus will reduce the quality of service.

Dr. Hania Shalkami

She commented that we should differentiate between illness and health in general; the draft law focuses on the insurance on “illness” and a big part of the problem is related to the omission of the state’s responsibility towards health and other social influential aspects and other mechanisms related to nutrition, prevention and others, adding that there should be a follow-up and accountability mechanism in the law.

Answer of Dr. Ayman El Sabeh

In the beginning Dr. Ayman explained the objective of the law draft and it is to develop a framework to reform hospital problems and prepare future solutions

- 1- In response to the lack of statistics related to the health service, Dr. Ayman confirmed that the project of the community assessment for health hospitals is a project that is being implemented by various civil society organizations in the republic since a year ago. The aim of this project is to establish a new type of health services data based on the views of the service recipients and users, along with training a group of service recipients at the national level to work on evaluating hospitals using telephone applications according to standards that meet with the patient vision. 11 groups have already been trained in 11 governorates across the republic. The accuracy of this information is being verified, analyzed and presented to officials at the national and regional level and discussions are taking place to reach solutions for the detected crises. Last year, the project succeeded in obtaining 510 community assessments for hospitals and currently we are preparing a telephone application that allows the citizen to evaluate the service without receiving a special training.
- 2- In terms of the quality referred to by Dr. Mona Mina, Dr. Ayman commented by saying that the data and statistics show that the private sector provides good quality services, perhaps in the governorates of Cairo and Alexandria and services of a lower quality in the other ones. Public hospitals provide a better service because of the infrastructure and teams of trained doctors and nurses who work according to an administrative framework that allows them to provide better service, and sometimes the disgraceful of public hospitals is poor management or lack of resources. The law aims at fixing all these problems in general and there is a fault assumption that the private sector is able to provide better service, as there is a special department for accreditation and what has been observed is that the number of private hospitals that have been provided with the accreditation is very small due to inappropriate infrastructure and equipment.
- 3- As for privatization and partnership with the private sector, Dr. Ayman said that these terms should not be perceived negatively in general; the partnership with the private sector offers the partners guarantees so it does not affect the price, type and presentation of the service



and does not lead to the expulsion of one of the workers. Cooperation with the private sector is carried out in accordance with critical frameworks that ensure the provision of proper service to the citizen.

- 4- As for the “imposition of contributions”, he agrees with what mentioned before and expressed his personal objection to the imposition of contributions through the law because for imposing further burdens on citizens.
- 5- The definition of incapable ones is still under the discussion.
- 6- In terms of “failure to pay the premiums leads to being deprived from receiving governmental services, including education”, there is not included in any law whatsoever.
- 7- He agrees with the idea that the state is not serious and not committed and believes that the draft law aims to legally impose obligations on the state.

- 1- The community assessment gate of Egyptian hospitals is an essential baseline.
- 2- The objective of the law is to develop a plan to reform these matters and the need for the existence of syndicates and social movements.
- 3- One of the most important achievements is the way hospitals are evaluated through groups using phone applications and then verifying database and displaying them to the public which increases the commitment rate and the assessment will be annual in order to follow up the improvement.
- 4- Each hospital will be evaluated by 3 teams, knowing that the quality of the public sector is much better than the private sector.
- 5- Partnerships with the private sector are not a bad thing if they are accompanied by special regulations.

Comments of Dr. Magdy Abdel Hamid

- The problem is the assumption that the general context of the state functioning is successful, while the reality shows a general failure in the implementation of policies. In this regard, are we talking about health in Egypt as a right for citizens or health as a service? He pointed out that if the treatment is associated with fees, the system is destroyed and this is the purpose of the discussion.

Dr. Sherine Al-Shawarbe

An agreement is necessary to solve the problem. If the debate continues about the poor situations, we are not going to find solutions. Every time we object to an issue, they say this not the new version of the law without disclosing the new version and thus there is lack in information. This must also apply in education but all social authorities are never allowed to pass even through the school wall. The question is whether there is available information about the lack of basic resources in hospitals. Recently, declarations have been issued of sudden visits by health officials to hospitals, which is illogical as they are aware of the situation.



Third Dialogue (round table and discussion)

Facilitator of the session: Dr. Sherine Al-Shawarbe

Main Commentators: Dr. Nevin Kabbaj - Ministry of Social Solidarity

Dr. Hania Shalkami - Research Professor at the Social Research Center at the American University in Cairo

Dr. Hania Shalkami

- 1- Social justice means inclusive systems that tackle resources and redistribution, but corruption is the current redistribution method which leads to an instability in the families and social relations (including wages, etc.).
- 2- There has been an improvement with time in terms of introducing women in social systems.
- 3- The security pension system in Egypt has not changed since the sixties except in two cases; the first was the addition of a new eligible category (in the nineties, there was the addition of the female breadwinners to some of some of the employees of the state, family of a prisoner and families of vulnerable recruited soldiers) and the second was the change in the amounts meaning that the system and its methods of implementation has not been reviewed not mentioning the bureaucracy system in the procedures as the majority of the beneficiaries are not aware whether or not they meet the eligibility criteria.
- 4- Insurance employees in Egypt are doing very important work but their work mechanisms need to be updated, as well as the concepts of poverty and the old and inaccurate definitions.
- 5- We also need to update the implementation mechanisms by creating a database for researchers.
- 6- The system needs to be developed especially in what concerns the eligibility principles through a non-categorized targeting whereas the eligibility is based on the need and not on specific category. Takaful and Karama Program is an unconditional conversion of the unemployed category (children, disabled...). Takaful allocated a sum for the poor family without conditions especially if there is a disability or other health issue in the family. Takaful also binds children to attend 85% of the school year days and ensures that the family is receiving preventive health services which are positive and advanced conditions. For instance in Ain al-Sira, we found that the average of expenditure of poor families on a child in April before the exams was equivalent to 164 pounds meaning that families are saving money for education so we allocated an amount for education and in return the child during must attend school.
- 7- A part of the protection is not covered by the ministry. Is the philosophy and objectives of the Takaful and Karama Program are consistent?



Dr. Nevin Kabbaj

She pointed out that social protection is an integrated group and its foundations are clear:

1. Achieving minimum basic income security in the form of cash support.
2. Contribute in providing basic social services.
3. Social integration through working and offering employment opportunities for young people.

The social justice system is Developmental, It is not a charity but it is a right for citizens to provide the minimum of social and economic risks, it is an expansionary idea of monetary support, it is an individual and collective entitlement to implement the principles of equal opportunity and social justice. It is complementary to the family. The aim is to expand the base of the beneficiaries and introduce orphans and elderly, people with disabilities and natural disasters. We need a flexible and gentle application to be followed, and to follow-up on it and assess it. Social protection should be defined as: achieving the minimum basic of the income in the form of cash support, contributing in providing basic social services and social integration through working and providing employment opportunities. Also the Ministry of Social Solidarity is committed to develop a fair social protection network targeting poor families (About 20% of the population), which prevents them from getting their basic needs, and guarantee their children's health and education and extend the protection network to include groups that do not have the capacity to work and be productive, such as the elderly (65+) or those with disabilities that prevent them from working or orphans.

The Ministry has identified the strategic priorities for the development of the social protection system: expanding the social safety network, mechanization of monetary support system and develop the integrated database on poor families, the establishment of an effective governmental-civil relief mechanism, the expansion of school feeding programs, the provision of rehabilitation and employment opportunities, expanding the insurance coverage of state employees, extending the social safety network for those who are rehabilitated from addiction and strengthening partnership with NGOs. Some of the new issues have emerged in this developed social protection system: the adoption of a conditional cash support approach, targeting to rationalize the use of resources allocated to support, linking the support period, mechanization and modernization of the system of social protection, social communication and maximize coordination between the concerned authorities.

UNDEF then highlighted the basic challenges facing social protection programs from the limited capabilities and skills of functional machinery, rise in the poverty rates, etc. she concluded by mentioning the partners in these projects (Ministries of Agriculture, Education, Health, Planning and Interior, as well as NGOs, the private sector, the Post Office and the international authorities) and concluded by mentioning the most important achievements of the program till now; "Takaful and Karama".



Professor Sherine Al-Shawarbi

She pointed out that there are some reservations, especially in what concerns the commitment of the Ministry of Social Solidarity to cover the poorest 20% of the population, although the initial indicators exceeded 30%. What is the fate of the rest of the poor while the goal should be to cover everyone classified as poor on one hand and on the other, the system lacks the support of oil, the ration cards and health insurance. This, is contrary to some of the other forms of support. A debate on the balance of these factors should be tackled. She added that the Social security programs were not clear in their objectives, contrary to the Takaful and Karama program.

Professor Hania Shalqami

She commented on the fact that there is a mechanism for social reflection at the level of the Council of Ministers "Social Justice Unit" on the goal and outputs and the impact of those programs on citizens to work on reform and follow-up in the future to achieve a unified positive goal.

Professor Sherine Al-Shawarbi

The Increases concerning the Social Security Pension have to comply with the balance and must be taken as an example, i.e: The social security pension cannot be increased without increasing the minimum pension "contribution" in the event of a deficit, as this has already happened.

Professor Mohammed Shirin

The state sets goals and put them into discussions without a realistic application, an example is the budget 2014-2015 of social security pensions estimated at (ten billion seven hundred million) and the following year after the application of the system of Takaful and Karama, pensions have decreased of four billion. The following year 2016/2017 witnessed a reduction of pensions. Besides, the monetary support from the total budget is decreasing over the years. He added that the government's speech considers that Takaful and Karama is a gift or a favor, not a right of the citizen.

Professor Besan Kassab

There has been a strong denial of the favorable relationship to the expansion of security pensions and financial reform measures. The launch of Takaful and Karama came in the same year as when the support on energy was reduced. It also came in the same year in which the loan was completed with the Fund, thus an increase in Takaful and Karama.

Professor Sherine Al-Shawarbi

There is no denial of the relationship but the program cannot be considered as a compensation mechanism in accordance with the ongoing reforms.



Answer of Dr. Neven Kabbaj

There are notable developments, the first is the existence of a database for families for the first time in addition to the existence of mechanisms in order to achieve community participation and the development of grievance mechanisms, as the picture is neither glamorous nor black.

Questions

1. The conditions exist and are theoretically effective but, in practice, how do we ensure the achievement?
2. What is the point of denying the direct relationship between the expansion of the need for funding and the financial procedures?
- 3 – Why is it that a part of the sustainable development objectives is ignored, which is no other than to improve the status of NGOs?
4. How can the government be questioned while the associations are closing?



Fourth Dialogue

Facilitator of the session: Ms. Beesan Kassab

Main Commentators: Ms. Sarah Eid - Ministry of Finance

Mr. Mohamed Gad - Egyptian Journalist and economic researcher

Dr. Fatima Ramadan - Trade union and researcher in labor affairs in Egypt

Professor Sarah Eid spoke about the financial policies and the most important work of the Ministry of Finance interested in involving the citizen because the principle is to re-spend the resources contributed by this citizen (taxes) again on him to achieve justice. The goal is also to achieve real accountability and any reform must be in harmony among all authorities.

Prof. Sarah then continued to display a video showing how public budget funds were spent, mentioning after that there are imbalances in the budget because we spend much more than our resources, which ultimately leads to a deficit and the accumulation becomes a public debt and added that the import is more than the supply which led to a deficit in the trade balance and the duplication of the deficit was reflected on the general level of prices and inflation. The professor commented that the government keeps on borrowing on the local and international level without a real source to fill the money back, not to mention the increase in interest rates and the inability to invest and the depreciation of the currency. Besides, the government is taking a large part of borrowing from the banking sector to compete with the private sector. There are ambitious programs for an inclusive economic reform already presented by the government and it has been discussed in the Parliament. Parts of it are already being implemented to achieve fiscal control and to reduce the budget deficit, which in the end will lead to lower prices and to achieve balance. The current growth rate is only 4%, which is much lower than the available possibilities, while the inflation rate is 21%, which is a large rate by all standards. There are reform measures taken since last November that affected the citizens when it comes to price raising but they are delayed procedures and it was necessary to have a Flexible exchange rate and reforms in the tax system, including VAT and Civil service law and the movement of the price of energy and others, there have been procedures that have returned Egypt to the global market through the issuance of dollar bonds as it reflects the trust of investors in the long-term investment in Egypt and the purchase of the license of the fourth generation expected to flow with the IMF, the World Bank and the African Development Bank and the currency swap agreement with China.

She stressed that the ministry aims to work on community dialogue on measures by making information available and streamlining it with regard to measures to be implemented in the coming years in order to achieve transparency and community accountability, the Ministry of Planning and the Ministry of Local Development participate in this community dialogue and in fact programs were implemented to simplify information and figures (citizens' budget) and to respond to the causes of disability and inflation and it was made available on the website and the Ministry's pages on the social media in addition to conferences such as the real estate tax conference in Alexandria and in



universities and we aim to visit the rest of the provinces and added there are periodic meetings with civil society to discuss their vision of the most important mechanisms proposed for the next phase and conferences targeted health program and others, that's why reform procedures had to be taken including the return in public markets on management bonds and The SWAP with China as well as measures taken at the level of the International Monetary Fund. The government sought to adopt a participatory budget and to cooperate with the Ministry of Planning and the Central Bank as well as taking into account civil society, the people and parliamentarians. For three years, the Ministry of Finance has tried to land on the ground and explore the needs of citizens.

The most important actions that can be implemented in the medium run:

- 1- Increase the transparency of public finances and work on completing the issuance of the 8 documents for assessing the transparency of the general budgets of countries according to international standards.
- 2- The Information Technology team in the Ministry is currently preparing an integrated electronic system to facilitate the availability of data related to the general budget of the state in a form of electronic search and transfer it to the programs available to read, analyze tables and data and publish the eight budget documents on time, on a wide scale and in multiple media.
- 3- Holding meetings with leaders of the interests of customs and taxes.
- 4- Holding meetings with the owners of art, thought and culture as they are the guide to public opinion.
- 5- Develop a program that applies to mobile phones (phone application).

The most important long-term actions (over three years):

1. Implement the "Citizen Charter" with CARE International to discuss citizens' demands.
- 2 - Working on publishing the introduction of data of the Central Auditing Organization in accordance with the budget transparency index OBI
- 3 - Implementation of budget performance and open budget systems

Professor Fatima Ramadan

At the beginning, she pointed out that transparency is important to achieve social accountability, but it must be achieved in a serious way, adding that considering the strategy of 2030 it is noted that most of the runway is for business owners and projects and the rest of the citizens are not listed any data or plans for them, even in the decent work contract, it was not mentioned working hours and wages or other subjects which means that the government is not really interested in decent work conditions for promoting the speech of "the existence of cheap labor" for foreign investment. Besides, when a proposal was made about irregular employment, the aim was to collect money from them by integrating them into the tax system without a guarantee for the services provided to them and maintenance of rights, She pointed out that the strategy does not reflect the reality at all, especially in terms of the work on reducing the rate of inflation and control of wages and prices as the



budget deals with figures without a real vision of the lives of citizens and increased poverty because of the liberalization of pound exchange and other measures that have increased the suffering of citizens.

In the Professor's opinion, there is a bias view preferring the rich over the poor, for example, the tax is collected from the employee before he receives his wages and in his purchase of goods against the tax evasion of companies and businessmen.

She stressed that more than 50% of the workers in Egypt do not have social insurance, which means that when they reach the age of pension, they will not receive money and they will have to turn to the street or receive a pension of Takaful and karama, which is very low. She reiterates that the government discourse treats them as hooligans. She demanded in the end that there should be a real minimum wage sufficient to live, and to implement the maximum wage law that applies to everyone without exception and put in place a method to insure irregular employment.

Professor Mohamed Jad:

In his opinion, Professor Jad stressed that the idea of transparency adopted by the government when it comes to the budget is driven by international pressure, such as the World Bank and the Central Bank. However, data like the average wage of each individual working in a governmental agency is not available. When it comes to the education sector, institutions like USAID provided information about it because it is interested in it, while other sectors do not have any data and what is intended from the example that the idea of transparency is not fully implemented and incomplete. He added that when we look to the wages budget and compare them to each other in the different sectors, it was noted that the growth and recession rate is related to the democratic field and the political situation. There are entire sectors, for which there is no information, such as those that are subject to some ministries like public transportation, police and others.

Discussion

Professor Beesan Kassab

She pointed out that the issue of wages and fiscal discipline is a political issue in the first field. She added that there are excellent programs in some ministries, but they do not reflect the reality or provide social protection. In view of the methods adopted by the Ministry of Finance for social dialogue in the absence of syndicates, which play a close role with the citizens don't manifest in the weakness of the syndicates itself but in smashing the syndicates' independence and pluralism exercised by the state.

Answer of Professor Sarah Eid

- She first pointed out that the capital profit tax law on the stocks is impeded because of the businessmen and the objective of initiating transparency and other procedures is to provide information in the beginning and we have a big challenge to face these obstacles in order to



achieve a strong balance. She added that the subject of tax reform is a long journey and the declaration of the tax on the VAT to remove sales tax alterations and to stop tax evasion. 57 commodities are already exempt from taxation in order to reduce consumption and impose a certain type of recreational goods.

- There is on the website “analytical statement of the budget”, it contains information and I hope that when there is a shortage of information, to work on communicating to provide this information to researchers and achieve transparency gradually.

Dr. Soumaya Ibrahim

She pointed out that there have been discussions about the balance between the two social genders but it has not been mentioned and has been forgotten recently, which is a very important issue that should not be overlooked.

Professor Omayma Kamal

She assured that there is an undeniable improvement in the rate of transparency but the question is how much is the impact of the citizen participation on decision-making?

Ghossoun Tawfik

She commented on the idea of participatory budgeting that the Ministry of Finance adopted a downward approach to the citizen but what is common is that it is done in the opposite way. An example is, the Participatory budgets that are made in Latin America by the localities.

Answer of Professor Sarah Eid

She agreed with the idea and added that the Ministry of Finance is trying to achieve that in the available time to reach a compromise which is to merge the two approaches. For example, we have already held several sessions of discussions in local villages and councils.

- With regard to the balance policy between the two social genders, there are initial attempts to be implemented such as the Women's Aid Project and the Equal Opportunity Unit that are conducting activities in this field and the website can be checked to follow their activities.

All what they are talking about in the Ministry are projects to implement. There is not even a single clause on decent work, housing problems and other problematic issues. The employee pays the tax twice on the contrary of the rich and the big companies.

Also, the absence of insurance leads to an increase of the support when the person ages and has no compensation.

The Ministry of Finance is implementing the "top down and bottom up approach".

QUESTION: When will we see the army's budget in a clause other than the "other" clause?



Daily Dialogue Outputs

1. The strategy for sustainable development has been discussed, but sometimes this framework has been abandoned.
2. The goals of the strategy are important and ambitious, but there are no economic, social or investment mechanisms that are put in place.
3. There is no trust in the indicators of the state (poverty line ...) however, there are assumptive numbers.
4. Lack of mechanisms of questioning and accountability, lack of a minimum of authority as well as lack in the follow-up and assessment.
5. Transparency and lack of availability of information, especially in terms of needs and achievements.
6. Measurement mechanisms are foreign and not clear and exclude associations. We must make sure of our figures as NGOs.
7. The next report will discuss social justice in Egypt.